Education and Learning Research Journal

**Peer Review Checklist**

Instructions: Additional comments are welcome in your e-mail communication. We request that you answer the 10 questions posited below[[1]](#endnote-1) with either *yes,* *no,* or *n.i*. (needs improvement). Please remember that as we consider your expert opinion, and appreciate its value, the final decision on whether to publish the article belongs to the editorial committee. In advance, we would like to give you thanks for your participation in the review process.

**A. Relevance and significance:**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| 1. Does the article address a well-defined issue that can be researched objectively? |  |
| 2. Will the thesis be relevant to those interested in bilingual education? |  |
| 3. Does the paper use and progressively build upon existing knowledge in the field? |  |
| 4. Does it offer new knowledge? |  |

**Additional comments:**

**B. Bibliography and methods:**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| 5. Are the bibliographic sources respectable and clearly identified? |  |
| 6. Are the references appropriate and up to date? |  |
| 7. Does the author use a critical perspective? |  |
| 8. Are the weaknesses within the research process openly admitted? |  |

**Additional Comments:**

**C. Presentation of thesis:**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| 9. Are the conclusions presented in an accurate and academic way? |  |
| 10. Is the thesis clearly supported by the information found in the article? |  |

**Additional Comments:**

* **General Comments:** Please write a brief review describing your professional opinion about the paper.

**Type of Articles:**

Please select the most appropriate category that best describe this article.

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **TYPE OF ARTICLE** | **DESCRIPTION** | **SELECT (X)** |
| **Scientific and Technological Research Article** | A document which presents, in a detailed way, the original results of a research project. The structure generally contains seven important sections an abstract, an introduction, a review of the literature, the methodology, the outcomes, the conclusions and a reference list. |  |
| **Reflective Article** | A document which presents, in a detailed way, the results of a research Project from the analytical, interpretative, or critical perspective of the author, on a specific topic, with clear references to the original sources. |  |
| **Revision Article** | A document which is the result of research in which the results of certain research projects in a field which have or have not been published are analyzed, systematized and integrated together with the objective of demonstrating the advances and developmental tendencies. This type of manuscript is characterized by its presentation of a careful bibliographic summary of at least 50 references. |  |
| **Short Article** | A brief document which presents original preliminary or partial outcomes of a scientific/ technological research project which requires rapid dissemination. |  |
| **Case Study** | A document which presents the outcomes of a particular study with the objective of building awareness of the technical and methodological experiences. It includes, from the literature available, a systematic summary of similar cases with comments. |  |
| **Literature review** | A document which contains a critical review of the literature on a particular theme in bilingual education. |  |
| **Letter to the editor** | The expression of a critical, analytical or interpretative positions based on articles previously published in the journal. It should be contribute critical insights to the discussions in the field. |  |
| **Editorial** | A document written by the editor, a member of the editorial committee or a guest researcher about orientations in the thematic overview of the journal. |  |
| **Translation** | Personal translations of either classics or current texts which are important for the advancement of the field of bilingual education. |  |
| **Transcription** | A modern, more readable translation of important historical documents or transcription of otherwise orally-transmitted information from the field of bilingual education. |  |
| **Annotated Bibliography** | A collection of summarizations and commentaries on works which are particularly important to the history and development of the field of bilingual education. |  |

**-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------**

**Your participation in this process is “blind.” Your name will not be disclosed to the author(s). The information below is for the editor’s records. Thank you for your time.**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Name** |  |
| **Complete mailing address** |  |
| **Title of paper reviewed** |  |
| **Date review returned** |  |



1. The checklist has been adapted to our needs according to the standards for research and evaluation proposed by the IES: *Institute for Educational Sciences*, Washington, D.C. [↑](#endnote-ref-1)